

In his keynote address to the 2012 EAERE Conference in Prague, Professor Dr William D. Nordhaus claimed that there is a potential division by zero in the FUND model developed by Dr David Anthoff and Professor Dr Richard S.J. Tol.

While true, Professor Nordhaus omitted that Dr Anthoff and Professor Tol do not actually divide by zero or come close to doing so. Division-by-zero errors manifest themselves clearly, and neither routine nor bespoke tests have indicated that such a mistake was made in any of the published results.

Professor Nordhaus justified his claim with reference to a paper by Mr Frank Ackerman and Mr Charles Munitz, published in Ecological Economics.

Unbeknownst to Professor Nordhaus, Professor Dr David I. Stern, associate editor, was about to publish a comment. Professor Stern notes that the paper is wrong in five places and on two points:

1. The paper attributes work to Anthoff and Tol that is not by Anthoff and Tol.
2. The paper falsely claims that there is an division-by-zero error in the work of Anthoff and Tol.

Professor Stern also notes that Mr Ackerman and Mr Munitz suppressed information that showed that their conclusion is false.

In a further comment, Dr Anthoff and Professor Tol show that the tests in the Ackerman and Munitz paper are inconclusive.

Dr Richard S.J. Tol MEA  
Professor of Economics  
Mantell Building 2b23  
University of Sussex  
Falmer, Brighton, BN1 9RF  
United Kingdom

Professor of the Economics of Climate Change  
Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam, The Netherlands

Voice +44 1273 877282  
Skype richardsjtol  
Email [r.tol@sussex.ac.uk](mailto:r.tol@sussex.ac.uk)