

Re: Our response

David Stern [david.stern@anu.edu.au]

Sent: Wednesday, June 13, 2012 7:31 PM

To: Frank Ackerman

Frank

Thanks for the revised version. I am happy with it. I attach my comment. I tried to be really neutral. I don't say in the comment that I agree with all of Tol's corrections just that he requested them but I do agree that some statements in your paper were "problematic". I certainly never agreed to Tol's claims that this was formally "libel" etc. Also I don't say that you deliberately did anything wrong just that you didn't report the information that Tol and Anthoff gave you. I also attach the letter I sent to Tol on the results of my investigation.

David